

Mumbai Metro Line-3 Colaba-Bandra-SEEPZ(Fully U/G)

Public Hearing for EIA and SIA study of Metro Line -3

Vide newspaper Notification Dated 12th Dec 2011 suggestions / objections from concerned stakeholders were invited for Environmental Impact Assessment and Social Impact Assessment (EIA & SIA) of Metro Line 3 (Colaba – Bandra – SEEPZ). M/s RITES consultants has submitted Draft EIA report draft SIA. A public hearing for concerned stakeholders of the project was organized on 11th April 2012 the details given below.

Date	Time	Venue
11 th April, 2012	10.00 am - 1.00 pm	Insurance Institute of India (college of Insurance), 'G'block, Plot no.C-46, Bandra-Kurla Complex, Bandra(E) Mumbai-400051

2. Public hearing was attended by 200 stakeholders and 27 stakeholders raised their suggestion objection. Hearing panel consist of following officers :-

- (1) Shri Rahul Asthana, Chairman, MMRC
- (2) Shri S.V.R. Srinivas, MD, MMRC
- (3) Shri P.R.K. Murthy, Director, MMRC
- (4) Shri G.R. Madan, Director, MRTS
- (5) Shri Vishram Patil, Chief, R&R
- (6) Shri Vikas Tondwalkar, JT.PD (Env.)
- (7) Shri V.K. Phatak, Urban planning Expert Ex-Chief, T&CP Division

Details of suggestion objection raised by stakeholders are summarized below.

Token No.	Name	Suggestion/Objection	MMRC Remark
4	Nitin Kilawala	Metro line 3 to be combined with Metro line 2 and One depot location can be saved. He has submitted Alignment plan and mentioned about ridership. A letter addressed to the then C.S., GoM, Shri Johnny Joseph by Mr. Shridharan, MD, DMRC was read by him regarding Charkop-Bandra-Colaba corridor and MMRDA later changed as Charkop-Bandra-Mankhurd corridor.	PPP contract has been awarded for Metro Line 2 (Charkop – Bandra – Mankhurd). Merging with Line 3 is not possible at this stage. Area required for a combined depot will be much greater than the space available at any one site. Combined depot will not be feasible for Metro Train operation of Line-2 and Line-3
22	Rishi Agarwal	Aarey Milk Colony should be taken up very strongly. He supported metro line 2 – 3 connectivity. MMRC has a responsibility for mass public transport; it has also responsibility towards environment. How to dispose of the muck coming out of excavation? Where will it be dumped?	MMRC is working on several options for muck disposal. Due care will be taken with regards to environmental impact. MMRC has already undertaken EIA study for Metro Line 3.
21	Satish Ashtaputre	He supported for fully underground section and expressed doubt regarding completion year 2019 in light of VAG corridor Line 1 experience. How much will be the fare? What are the minimum and the maximum? The area from where the line 3 will go through is a very highly congested area. We have to take great caution because of the underground cables, pipelines, etc.	Based on experience of Line 1 and other underground metros in India MMRC will device a construction plan including comprehensive utility diversion to complete project within given time frame. MMRC is in the process for fare fixation for line 3.
5	Ms. Kunika Lal	MMRC to take utmost care for underground utilities Disaster Plan and Evacuation Plan etc. to be prepared. She also supported Metro line 2-3 connectivity.	MMRC will device a comprehensive utility diversion plan. Disaster and evacuation plans will be as per Indian standards
38	D'souza	Absolutely no problem with underground alignment. Supported the idea of Metro line 2-3 connectivity to avoid duplication. Difficult to understand the logic of having 2 parallel lines.	Line 2 and 3 are serving different areas and there is no duplication.

50	Ashok Datar	Due to metro line 3 coastal road not required. Enquired about cost per k.m. of underground metro.	Coastal road project is not linked with Metro Line 3. Approximate cost of u/g metro is Rs 600 cr / km
20	Anil Gaikwad	Enquired about people living in Ballard Estate, Colaba, Gateway of India to access metro station. How will you connect this metro line with the main line?	CST station, Churchgate, Cuffe Parade Station and Hutatma Chowk stations serve these areas. Metro stations will be integrated with suburban stations at interchange points with main lines
1	Sudhir Badami	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. High cost of underground metro 2. Suburban train overcrowded, 44% walk trips and 3.1% cars 3. Enquired about technical details of metro line 3 4. DPR not available 5. Method of construction 6. Disaster Management Plan, Evacuation Plan etc. 7. Mumbai affected by seismic zone 8. Commuter dispersal at stations 9. Encouraged BRTS due to less cost and less time for construction. 10. Metro projects are very costly & time consuming 	<p>Technical details and DPR is available for review at MMRC office.</p> <p>Tunnelling by TBM, stations by either cut and cover or NATM.</p> <p>MMRC will device a comprehensive utility diversion plan. Disaster and evacuation plans will be as per Indian standards</p> <p>MMRC will take due care during detailed design stage</p> <p>Since ridership is in excess of BRTS capacity metro is required to satisfy demand.</p>
51	Rep. from Indian Institute of Shipping	Sky walk third party audit done by them. We are involved in fire safety and can guide MMRC, if associated. How to minimise construction cost?	MMRC will consider the suggestion if appropriate, though not relevant in present context.
36	Rajesh	There are 2 stations. It is going through Marol slum. Why these stations are so close? Why it should go through the slum?	Marol naka station is an interchange station with Line 1. 3 stations have been proposed in Airport as per their requirement.
17	Mr. Poojari	Some numbers are put in slums at Marol Naka. What is the meaning of that? From where will the project start? Whether the numbers will increase or decrease? When we can get an idea? When and where will we be shifted?	<p>Slum numbering is part of survey work being done for SIA.</p> <p>Project extends from Colaba to SEEPZ</p> <p>MMRC is in process of determining R&R sites.</p> <p>The actual impact for resettlement will depend on detailed designs. Affected persons will be shifted to nearby R&R Colony where tenements are available</p>

5	Ms. Kunika Lal	We want to know about the problems we will be facing because of this metro line 3? One more hearing for PAPs may be held? VAG experience is very bad.	MMRDA can hold meetings with representatives of people and provide necessary information to them.
34	Sandip	Line 3 is very good for the future of Mumbai. We cannot deny the role of slum people for the development of Mumbai. When we loose our place please give us good place to settle within the same locality. So that we can serve the people of Mumbai. Please explain why you cannot settle us in nearby places. It is good for the future of our country.	PAPs can join local Slum Rehabilitation Scheme if such scheme is promoted by developer and is feasible, and MMRDA can provide transit accommodation. If SR Scheme is not feasible PAPs will be shifted to nearby R&R colony depending on availability of tenements.
35	MIDC Zopadpatti representative	Rehabilitate PAPs nearby and do not send to far off place. Take confidence of PAPs living in slums. People have got different views.	As above (token No.34)
51	Sandip Patil	He enquired about technical details of metro line 3 like diameter of tunnel, width etc. He had suggested 7 storey building to be constructed within 20 mtr. width and partly rehabilitate PAPs and sale remaining flats for public to recover part cost of metro line 3. Due to this vibration effect will be less. He will give the detailed presented of the same to MMRC officials in due course.	MMRC will consider the proposal and will take appropriate decision.
61	Shailesh Sawant	Your officers also should come. People at home are getting afraid because some people came to put the number in their slums. Please do not give to any agency to put no. Only MMRDA officers/staff should come for this. Please give the prior date on Sundays so that all the concerned association people are called.	MMRDA can hold meetings with representatives of people and provide necessary information to them
71	Anil Galgali	Give details of Central Assistance to MMRDA for executing infrastructure projects in Mumbai.	Central govt. will give equity and subordinate debt for the project
55	Shubhangi Sarang	What is the role of MMRDA in Girgaon. Redevelopment. How much area will be taken for dev.? Area for sub-station 162 sq. mtr. marked and enquired about details of R&R,	MMRDA will jointly discuss with society & Redevelopment Agency. Due compensation for area acquired will be given under LA / R&R Policy

57	Rajesh	Meeting should be arranged in the area of Project affected people. All PAPs should be taken in to Confidence , enquired about project whether U/G	MMRDA can hold meetings with representatives of people and provide necessary information to them
78	Mr. Almeida	Where is the dumping ground? Mumbai affected by seismic fault line and how you will evacuate passengers?	MMRC is in the process of examining various options for muck disposal and finalising muck disposal strategy. Designs will account for Mumbai's seismic zone. Disaster and evacuation plans will be as per Indian standards
7	Sawant	Location for metro – Whether it is underground or elevated? Our beaches will be lost due to coastal road Prabhadevi – Mahim. He enquired about some connectivity project belong to MCGM.	Proposed Metro line-3 is fully U/G
77	Shri. Prasad	Numbers put on slums in Marol area and enquired about reason. Enquired about R&R compensation / TDR . What is the criteria for rehabilitation? Whether you will take care of owner ?	Survey being done for SIA. The rehabilitation will be done as per MUTP R&R policy approved by Govt. and based on BSFS.
66	Sudhir	When line 3 will be implemented practically? What are the SRA plans?	Implementation of Mumbai Metro Line-3 is proposed between 2013 and 2019.
72	Rahaman	There are more than 10,000 houses at Chimatpada. How you are going to settle them? Whether MMRDA is the authority to change the RG/PG. There is a PIL and court order for no development and enquired about whether metro can be constructed. He enquired about SRA schemes. Basic facilities like schools, markets, temple etc to be constructed.	MMRDA does not have the authority to change the D. P. reservations but it can examine the matter and offer possible help. The R&R colonies are provided facilities as per the SR Scheme norms.
80	L. M. Sagar	Benefit to be given to people affected by metro. They need job in Metro. They need house there only.	PAPs can join SRA Scheme if locally feasible else will be rehabilitated in R&R colonies.
73	Mr. Gilroy J.Misquitatz	Is there any special schemes for the Adivasis?	Policy /Scheme not yet finalized.
64	Pramod Shinde	When will you conduct the next meeting? You have to declare the meeting date today. There should be transparency in conducting survey of slums.	The details of survey will be explained to PAP, Stakeholders. Survey is being conducted by NGO SPARC and the process is transparent.

		Enquired about 1 point contact officer from MMRC Advised to form a committee amongst them.	MMRC has designated Community Development Assistants to address R&R issues of this project. The PAPs should form representative committee with whom meetings can be held.
--	--	---	---