



Mumbai Metro Rail Corporation Limited

(JV of Govt. of India and Govt. of Maharashtra)

Response to Queries regarding 'Appointment of Consultant for Bid Process Management of Non-Fare Box Revenue Streams for Mumbai Metro Line-3' RFP

Date: December 01, 2022

Ref.: Request for Proposal (RFP) for 'Appointment of Consultant for Bid Process Management of Non-Fare Box Revenue Streams for Mumbai Metro Line-3' published on November 14, 2022
https://www.mmrc.com/sites/default/files/MMRC_NFBR_BPM_RFP_14.11.2022.pdf

Given below is a compilation of response to the queries received from interested bidders regarding 'Appointment of Consultant for Bid Process Management of Non-Fare Box Revenue Streams for Mumbai Metro Line-3' RFP. You may take this into consideration in your bid submission. The last date for bid submission is Wednesday, December 21, 2022.

SN	Section No.	Query Received	MMRCL Response
1	Criteria for Key Professionals ITC Clause 16 - Page 25 & ITC Clause 23.2 - Page 27	1. There is inconsistency between ITC 16 and 23.2 pertaining to the deployment of Support Professional as the former clause suggests specific Support staff and the latter allows it as per consultant's discretion. 2. Furthermore, we suggest to reduce the experience requirement of support professionals from 5 years to 3 years.	1. Refer Addendum Sr. No. 7 2. Tender conditions prevail
2	Evaluation under criteria for Key Professionals ITC Clause 23.2 - Page 27	1. Please provide a detail on how the key personnel will be scored against the given parameters. 2. Please also clarify if the General experience will only consider number of years of experience of the key professional?	1 & 2. The parameters for Key Professional evaluation shall be at the discretion of MMRC's Technical Evaluation Committee.
3	Terms of Reference Section 3 - Page 30	Please confirm if the scope of advertisement includes both station advertisements and train wraps / inside-train advertisements.	Confirmed. The Consultant is required to explore other opportunities for advertisement too.
4	Terms of Reference Section 3 - Page 30	Please clarify if the scope of telecom services includes both indoor and outdoor Telecom infrastructure.	Confirmed. MMRC envisages telecom services to be provided within the underground stations and tunnels. In addition, the Consultant may explore possibility of at-grade telecom infrastructure too.
5	Special Conditions of Contract Cl. 5.1.12.5 - Page 66	We suggest that instead of multiple insurance coverages which are relevant from a works contract perspective, the Authority may consider retention fee of 5% to be retained against the invoices raised, payable along with the final invoice once all deliverables are completed.	Tender conditions prevail
6	B. Data Sheet 3. Criteria for Technical Experience of firms (Note. iii) ITC Cl. 6a - Page 23	Please confirm that the eligible assignments should be from the last 10 years from the date of bid submission deadline.	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 2
7	Criteria for Key Professionals ITC Cl. 16 - Page 24	In our understanding, the scope of the assignment is very large covering almost 10 NFBR revenue sources including others, and therefore the man-months should be increased to 42 man months across all the key professionals.	Tender conditions prevail
8	Terms of Reference Deliverables & Payment Schedule Section 3 - Page 31	Please clarify how this payment will be made if there are more than 1 sources under "Others" and if there are no viable sources found.	Payment will be proportionately divided (i.e., equally distributed) in case of multiple revenue sources identified under "Others". Further, no payment will be processed if no revenue source is identified under "Others".

CIN U60100MH2008SGC181770

SN	Section No.	Query Received	MMRCL Response
9	General Conditions of Contract 5.1.12.4 Liability of the Consultants - Page 61	Request the Authority to cap the liability of the Consultants to 100% of the value of the contract, as currently the liability seems to be unlimited.	Tender conditions prevail
10	Instructions to Consultants 2. Introduction Clause 2.1 - Page 12	We request for the Authority to please modify the clause as: MMRCL intends to select an individual firm or Joint Venture/Consortium ("the Consultant") in accordance with the method of selection specified in the data sheet.	Tender conditions prevail
11	Data Sheet ITC Clause 6a 2. Turnover Criteria - Page 23	We request for the Authority to please modify the clause as: Minimum Average Annual Turnover of INR 100 Cr. for at least 3 Financial Year (FY) in the last 5 FY (FY 2016-17, 2017-18, 2018-19, 19-20, 20-21).	Tender conditions prevail
12	Special Conditions of Contract Clause 5.1.12.4 Limitation of the Consultants liability towards the Client - Page 65	We request the Authority to modify the clause as per the following: a) Except in case of gross negligence or wilful misconduct on the part of The Consultants or on the part of any person or firm acting on behalf of the Consultants in carrying out the services, the Consultants, with respect to damage caused by the Consultants to the Client's property, shall not be liable to the client: i) For any indirect or consequential loss or damage, and i) For any direct loss or damage that exceeds A) the total payments for Professional Fees and Reimbursable Expenditures made or expected to be made to the Consultants or B) Entitled to receive from any insurance maintained by the Consultants to cover such a liability, whichever of (A) or (B) is lower. b) The limitation of liability shall not affect the Consultants liability, if any, for damage to third parties, caused by the Consultants or any person or firm acting on behalf of the Consultants in carrying out the services.	Tender conditions prevail
13	Special Conditions of Contract Cl. 5.1.12.5 Risks and Coverages - Page 66	We request the Authority to modify the clause as per the following: The risks and the coverages shall be as follows: The insurance shall be taken from: Directorate of Insurance Maharashtra State, Mumbai - 400 051 a) Third Party motor vehicle liability insurance as required under Motor Vehicles Act, 1988 in respect of motor vehicles operated in India by Consultants or their Personnel or any Sub-Consultants or their Personnel for the period of consultancy. b) Third Party liability insurance with a minimum coverage of ₹ 5.0 lakh for the period of consultancy. c) Professional liability insurance valid for a period of consultancy with a minimum coverage equal to estimated remuneration and reimbursable as per 5.1.12.4(a) (II) of SCC of the consultancy. d) Client's liability and worker's compensation insurance in respect of the Personnel of the Consultants and of any sub-Consultant in accordance with the relevant provisions of the Applicable law, as well as, with respect to such personnel, any such life, health accident, travel or other insurance as may be appropriate and e) Insurance against loss of or damage to i) equipment purchased in whole or in part with funds provided under this contract, ii) the Consultants property used in the performance of the services and, iii) any documents prepared by the Consultants in the performance of the services.	Tender conditions prevail
14	Special Conditions of Contract Cl. 5.1.12.3 Confidentiality- Page 61	We request the authority to modify the clause as per the following: <i>"Except as otherwise permitted by this Agreement, neither of the parties may disclose to third parties the contents of this Agreement or any information provided by or on behalf of the other that ought reasonably to be treated as confidential and/or proprietary. Parties may, however, disclose such confidential</i>	Tender conditions prevail

SN	Section No.	Query Received	MMRCL Response
		<i>information to the extent that it: (a) is or becomes public other than through a breach of this Agreement, (b) is subsequently received by the receiving party from a third party who, to the receiving party's knowledge, owes no obligation of confidentiality to the disclosing party with respect to that information, (c) was known to the receiving party at the time of disclosure or is thereafter created independently, (d) is disclosed as necessary to enforce the receiving party's rights under this Agreement, or (e) must be disclosed under applicable law, legal process or professional regulations. The confidentiality obligations shall be valid for a period of 2 years from the date of termination of this Agreement."</i>	
15	Terms of Reference Completion of Services Section 3 - Page 31	We request the authority to modify with the following: <i>MMRCL and the Consultant shall retain its rights in its pre-existing intellectual property. Any intellectual property developed by the Consultant, and any working papers compiled in connection with the Services (but not the Information provided by MMRCL contained in them), shall be the property of the Consultant.</i>	Tender conditions prevail
16	General query	We request the authority to add the following clause: <i>"Consultant may terminate this Agreement, or any particular Services, immediately upon written notice to MMRCL if Consultant reasonably determines that it can no longer provide the Services in accordance with applicable law or professional obligations."</i>	Tender conditions prevail
17	General query	We request the authority to add the following clause: <i>Any information, advice, recommendations or other content of any reports, presentations or other communications we provide under this Agreement ("Reports"), other than Information provided by MMRCL, are for MMRCL's internal use only (consistent with the purpose of the particular Services) including MMRCL's board of directors, its audit committee, or its statutory auditors and not for disclosure externally outside your organization.</i>	Tender conditions prevail
18	Letter of Invitation & Details of Tender C. Duration of services - Page 7	We request the Authority to kindly provide 3 weeks of time for bid submission post issuance of the clarifications	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 1
19	ITC Clause 12. Sub Contracting - Page 15	Owing to specialized nature of scope to be delivered and longer duration of project term, we request the Authority for accord permission for sub-contracting Transit Media & Transit Retail Specialist and Commercial Revenue & Contracts Specialist.	Tender conditions prevail
20	Data Sheet - 6 (3a) Criteria for Technical Experience of Firms (Point 2) - Page 23	We request the Authority to kindly modify the criteria for Technical Experience of Firms as per below: 1. Undertaken Minimum 5 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments (including (pre-feasibility study / feasibility study / revenue model / business plan / strategy) / Financing / Business Plan / PPP Transaction Advisory/ Transit oriented development (TOD) study / Station Redevelopment / Land Monetization / Smart Card Ticketing projects) for non-fare revenue completed in transport sector in India. 2. Out of the aforementioned projects, minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue completed in metro sector in India with at least 10 stations.	1 & 2. Tender conditions prevail
21	Data Sheet - 6 (3a) Criteria for Technical Experience of Firms (Note. vi) - Page 23	We request the Authority to kindly modify the criteria for Technical Experience of Firms as per below: Eligible metro assignments may include those completed for Metro / Sub-urban Rail / Monorail / Metro Neo / RRTS / Railway Authorities including State and Central Government entities or private entities including PPP concessionaires	Tender conditions prevail

SN	Section No.	Query Received	MMRCL Response
22	Data Sheet - 6 (3a) Criteria for Technical Experience of Firms (Note. vi) - Page 23	We request for the Authority to please modify the clause as: All assignments shall be supported by a valid client completion/ appreciation certificate as stated in Form TECH-2. In the absence of such documentary proof, the assignment shall not be considered eligible for evaluation the Consultant shall submit certificate from Statutory Auditor certifying 100% fees received for the project.	Tender conditions prevail
23	Data Sheet - 6 (3a) Criteria for Technical Experience of Firms (Note. viii) - Page 23	We request the Authority to kindly modify the criteria as per following: For the ongoing projects being quoted, projects should be 80% 40% completed. Ongoing Work Certificate from Client stating that 80% 40% of the work has been completed should be submitted or Work Orders / Contracts along with CA certificate <u>or</u> receipts against invoices raised or equivalent proof that the assignment has been 80% 40% completed must be submitted.	Tender conditions prevail
24	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Technical Experience of Firms (Point 2) - Page 24	We request the Authority to kindly modify the clause as per the following: At least 2 out of the 4 proposed Key Professionals should be employee of the lead company, and 1 out of 4 proposed Key Professionals should be employee of the non-lead company/ <u>sub-contractor</u> .	Tender conditions prevail
25	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 24 & 25	1. We understand that deployment of Key Personnel are not envisaged to be deployed at the MMRCL. Please confirm. 2. Kindly clarify for the number of support staff envisaged for the proposal for estimation of efforts?	1. It is expected that Key Personnel shall be present for meetings organized by MMRCL. 2. Refer Clause No. 16 Criteria for Key Professionals (Pg. 25) of ITC & Refer Addendum Sr. No. 7
26	Letter of Invitation & Details of Tender C. Duration of services - Page 7	Request the Authority to extend the bid submission deadline by 2 weeks - by 26.12.2022 to accommodate for necessary arrangements and internal approvals for setting up a high-quality team and proposal document for the mentioned scope in the ToR.	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 1
27	Letter of Invitation & Details of Tender D. Deemed Knowledge and Disclaimer - Page 9	Request authority to review the clause and relax the conditions of expected liabilities/risks the bidder may incur in terms of development of assets in the project.	Tender conditions prevail
28	ITC Clause 12. Sub Contracting - Page 15	1. As per RFP, it is understood that the key personnel and support staff are required to be deployed in Mumbai during the project. 2. Request the authority to allow some of the key personnel and support staff to be engaged as sub-Consultant by the Consultant.	1 & 2. Tender conditions prevail
29	ITC Clause 14. Preparation of Proposals - Specific Considerations - Page 16	1. Request the authority to modify this clause as given below: It is desirable that the majority of the key professional staff proposed be on rolls as on date of contract signing. 2. Also request the authority to allow some of the key personnel and support staff to be engaged as sub-consultant by the Consultant.	1 & 2. Tender conditions prevail
30	ITC Clause 27. Availability of Key Professional staff/experts - Page 20	Request Authority to appropriately relax the penalty amount as mentioned in Clause 27.3 for replacement of staff, as there may be unavoidable scenarios outside Medical and Health, for replacing key staff members.	Tender conditions prevail

SN	Section No.	Query Received	MMRCL Response
31	Data Sheet ITC Clause 6a 1. General Conditions - Page 22	Request Authority to relax the mentioned clause and consider accepting self-certifications of projects along with proof of project deliverables as project credentials in this regard.	Tender conditions prevail
32	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 24	Request Authority to amend the clause as mentioned herein: Team Leader - Qualification: MBA/PGDM from Tier 1/Tier 2 institute / university Eligibility Assignment: Should have completed minimum 3 commercial/ revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in transport sector in India as Team Leader (in all urban transport sectors including Rail, Bus, Metro, Airports). Should have completed/ ongoing minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in metro sector in India as Team Leader.	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 3
33	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 25	Request Authority to amend the clause as mentioned herein: Transit Media & Transit Retail Specialist: Qualification: MBA/PGDM from Tier 1/Tier 2 institute / university Eligibility Assignment: Should have completed minimum 3 commercial/ revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in transport sector in India as Team Leader (in all urban transport sectors including Rail, Bus, Metro, Airports) Should have completed/ ongoing minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in metro sector in India Minimum experience – 10 years	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 4
34	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 25	Request Authority to amend the clause as mentioned herein: Commercial Revenue & Contracts Specialist: Qualification: CA/MBA/PGDM from Tier 1/Tier 2 institute / university Eligibility Assignment: Should have completed minimum 3 commercial/ revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in transport sector in India as Team Leader (in all urban transport sectors including Rail, Bus, Metro, Airports) Should have completed/ ongoing minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in metro sector in India. Minimum experience – 10 years	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 5
35	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 25	Since urban planners and Infrastructure planners also work in the similar subjects, Request Authority to amend the clause as mentioned herein: Urban Designer / Transport Planner / Engineer: Qualification: Post Grad in Urban Design/Transportation Planning/Transportation Engineering/ Urban Planning/ Infrastructure Planning or equivalent from Tier 1/Tier 2 institute / university Eligibility Assignment: Should have completed minimum 3 urban design / transport design/ urban planning/ transport planning/ traffic impact assessment assignments in India. Should have completed/ ongoing minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in metro sector in India. Minimum experience – 10 years	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 6
36	B. Data Sheet 3. Criteria for Technical Experience of firms (Note. iii) ITC Cl. 6a - Page 23	Request Authority to clarify if projects within 10 years of timeframe to be considered for technical evaluation from the bid submission deadline.	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 2

SN	Section No.	Query Received	MMRCL Response
37	Bidding Forms I. Form TECH-9: Litigation History Page 43	Request Authority to remove the clause of providing detailed Litigation history for the bid and instead accept an Undertaking in this regard as this may be a time-consuming exercise for firms/organizations.	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 10
38	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 24 & 25	1. Request Authority to clarify if the services need to be provided on-site in Mumbai at client office or otherwise. 2. Would like to suggest the Authority for partial deployment of key staff as per designated man months.	1. Services need to be provided on-site in Mumbai. 2. The Key Professionals should be available in Mumbai for the duration proposed in the bid.
39	Terms of Reference Section 3 - Page 30	Request Authority to provide clarifications on the typologies of primary surveys envisaged for the project.	Consultant shall carry out research and surveys to ensure latest data is available for evaluation.
40	Special Conditions of Contract Cl. 5.1.12.5 - Page 66	Most of the firms/organizations have a company level insurance which covers all employees. Request authority to consider that and exempt the requirement of getting a project level insurance.	Tender conditions prevail
41	Terms of Reference Section 3 - Page 31	Request Authority to clarify if monthly review meetings are deemed to be physical meetings in the client location itself. In this regard if the Authority has any provision for travel and accommodation of key experts (at national level) in the allotted budget, may please share the same.	Consultants' financial proposal shall include travel, accommodation, and all other expenses of their Key Professionals/staff.
42	Terms of Reference Section 3 - Page 31	.1. "Feasibility will apply to programme management workstreams as well." Request Authority to clarify on the extent of this scope as it will have time and cost implications. 2. If "Others" revenue stream includes more than one revenue stream, proportionate payment will be done for each step as given in the above table. Request Authority to clarify on the methodology of proportionate payment in this regard.	1. Programme management shall be undertaken for Direct Access. 2. Payment will be proportionately divided (i.e., equally distributed) in case of multiple revenue sources identified under "Others". Further, no payment will be processed if no revenue source is identified under "Others".
43	Terms of Reference Section 3 - Page 30	It is understood that the RFP Scope of work/TOR includes work of tender structuring, drafting tender documents, drafting RFPs, bid process management, support in LOAs and Agreements etc. the nature of this work is lined with legal work therefore request Authority to include a position for legal expert in team.	Tender conditions prevail. Consultant may deploy additional experts at their discretion.
44	ITC Clause 2. Introduction - Page 12	Request Authority to clarify if the pre-bid meeting will be physical at the Client office location or will be in hybrid mode. Request to share details of the pre-bid meeting.	Pre-bid meeting was held online on 22 November 2022 through Video Conference.
45	ITC Clause 28. Financial Negotiations - Page 20	Request Authority to share if there is any upper limit of remuneration rates for key professionals and support staff, for reference purpose, from similar contracts/projects.	No limits have been prescribed.
46	Data Sheet - 6 (3a) Criteria for Technical Experience of Firms (Note. viii) - Page 23	Request Authority to relax the criteria of completion of ongoing projects to 50%, accepting self-certifications/CA certifications as proof of project involvement for the said assignments.	Tender conditions prevail
47	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 25	Request authority to kindly elaborate on the educational and professional experience criteria for the support staff. As per our understanding, we assume the following educational qualifications for the mentioned support staff with 5 years of work experience in relevant fields: 1. Commercial Expert Jr. – Postgraduate in MBA/ CA 2. Transport Engineer – Postgraduate in Transport Planning, Traffic Engineering/ Infrastructure Planning or equivalent. 3. Architect Jr. – bachelor's in architecture. Please clarify if the assumptions are correct.	Tender conditions prevail for professional experience. Educational experience of the Support Staff should be relevant to the tasks assigned to them.

SN	Section No.	Query Received	MMRCL Response
48	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 25	"Other Sub-ordinate Staff for drafting, clerical work, etc. to be deployed as required." Request authority to kindly elaborate on the educational and experience criteria for the support staff. As per our understanding, we assume the following educational qualifications for the mentioned support staff with more than 1 year of work experience: Educational Qualification – Diploma / Graduate in any streams. Please clarify if the assumptions are correct.	Educational and professional experience of the Sub-ordinate Staff should be relevant to the tasks assigned to them.
49	Data Sheet ITC Clause 6a 3. Criteria For Technical Experience of Firms - Page 23	Request Authority to amend the clause as mentioned herein: 1. Minimum 3 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue completed in transport sector in India. 2. Out of the aforementioned projects, minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue completed in metro sector in India with at least 10 stations.	Tender conditions prevail
50	Terms of Reference Section 3 - Page 30	We understand that there are no primary surveys envisioned in the project as per the ToR – such as Market Rate analysis, Property rates Analysis, hence all analysis will be made based on Secondary data/ client provided data.	Consultant shall carry out research and surveys to ensure latest data is available for evaluation.
51	Terms of Reference Deliverables & Payment Schedule Sec. 3 - Pg 31	1. Request Authority to provide the provision of 10% mobilization advance in payment terms post award of the project. 2. Request to increase Success fee from 1% to 1.5%. Success fee shall not be linked with the 2-year equivalent license fee exceeding 100 cr. and shall be linked with the total license fee in 2-years as absolute.	1 & 2. Tender conditions prevail
52	Terms of Reference Deliverables & Payment Schedule Sec. 3 - Pg 31	Request Authority to clarify if in some cases bid evaluation is replaced by nomination-based selection, what will be the implication on the payment schedule which is based on activities associated with bid process management.	For nomination/sole-source based selection, the Consultant shall be responsible for evaluation of proposal, preparing scope of work, contract & other relevant documents for the appointment. Payment schedule shall stay the same.
53	Terms of Reference Deliverables & Payment Schedule Sec. 3 (Note. 7) - Pg 32	1. Request Authority to clarify if associated stakeholder engagements need to be conducted by the bidder in this regard. 2. As per our understanding, bidder will only engage in coordination with relevant stakeholders, however arrangement and costing implications for the same shall be borne by the client.	1. Confirmed. 2. All arrangements to be made by Consultant for stakeholder engagements & MMRCL shall reimburse to the extent of venue/buffet expenses, if any.
54	Data Sheet ITC Clause 6a 2. Turnover Criteria - Page 23	As the scope of services envisaged in the RFP documents needs a dedicated and focused team with rich experience in the non-fare box revenue assessment. This will need a broader strategy level inputs from the leaders in this field. In order to achieve the said objective, we suggest the Authority to increase the minimum average annual turnover from consultancy service to INR 300 cr.	Tender conditions prevail
55	Data Sheet ITC Clause 6a 3. Criteria For Technical Experience of Firms - Page 23	The key out of this assignment is revenue maximization via non-fare box revenue for metro sector projects in India. As the scope for revenue maximization is majorly done at the line or the corridor level where the number of stations may vary as per the requirement of the network and demand. Thus, correlating it to the minimum requirement will limit the Consultant's experience. Thus, we request the Authority to remove the number of stations as the eligibility.	Tender conditions prevail
56	Data Sheet - 6 (3a) Criteria for Technical Experience of Firms (Note. vi) - Page 23	Not many assignments are done under this category we request the authority to consider the Property development also as the category under non-fare box revenue. As the scope falls under the overall preview of non-fare box revenue enhancement. We request the Authority to also add Property development as one of the eligible components. We suggest the revised clause as follows: <i>v. Metro Rail Sector includes: All urban track-based transport systems such as metro, monorail, high speed rail, RRTS, etc. However, NFBR / secondary revenue sources should be a sizeable portion of the scope of assignment.</i>	Tender conditions prevail

SN	Section No.	Query Received	MMRCL Response																					
57	Data Sheet - 23.2 Evaluation Under Technical Experience of Firms - Page 26 & 27	<p>We suggest the revision of the evaluation criteria as per NCRTC. No. of projects are too high.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>S.N.</th> <th>Criteria</th> <th>Points</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td rowspan="4">1</td> <td>Experience in Non-Fare Revenue estimation/maximisation projects in transport sector in India or overseas Projects (excluding metro rail projects)</td> <td rowspan="4">10</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3 no. of qualifying projects: 70 of max points</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3-5 nos. of qualifying projects: 85% of max points</td> </tr> <tr> <td>More than 5 qualifying projects: 100% of max points</td> </tr> <tr> <td rowspan="4">2</td> <td>Experience in NFBR Revenue maximisation project in metro railway network in India and/or overseas</td> <td rowspan="4">12</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1 no. of qualifying projects: 70% of max points</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2 nos. of qualifying projects: 85% of max points</td> </tr> <tr> <td>More than 3 qualifying projects: 100% of max points</td> </tr> <tr> <td rowspan="4">3</td> <td>Experience in NFBR Revenue maximisation project in metro railway network in India or overseas – number of stations</td> <td rowspan="4">8</td> </tr> <tr> <td>10-25 stations: 70% of max points</td> </tr> <tr> <td>26-50 stations: 85% of max points</td> </tr> <tr> <td>More than 50 stations: 100% of max points</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	S.N.	Criteria	Points	1	Experience in Non-Fare Revenue estimation/maximisation projects in transport sector in India or overseas Projects (excluding metro rail projects)	10	3 no. of qualifying projects: 70 of max points	3-5 nos. of qualifying projects: 85% of max points	More than 5 qualifying projects: 100% of max points	2	Experience in NFBR Revenue maximisation project in metro railway network in India and/or overseas	12	1 no. of qualifying projects: 70% of max points	2 nos. of qualifying projects: 85% of max points	More than 3 qualifying projects: 100% of max points	3	Experience in NFBR Revenue maximisation project in metro railway network in India or overseas – number of stations	8	10-25 stations: 70% of max points	26-50 stations: 85% of max points	More than 50 stations: 100% of max points	Tender conditions prevail
S.N.	Criteria	Points																						
1	Experience in Non-Fare Revenue estimation/maximisation projects in transport sector in India or overseas Projects (excluding metro rail projects)	10																						
	3 no. of qualifying projects: 70 of max points																							
	3-5 nos. of qualifying projects: 85% of max points																							
	More than 5 qualifying projects: 100% of max points																							
2	Experience in NFBR Revenue maximisation project in metro railway network in India and/or overseas	12																						
	1 no. of qualifying projects: 70% of max points																							
	2 nos. of qualifying projects: 85% of max points																							
	More than 3 qualifying projects: 100% of max points																							
3	Experience in NFBR Revenue maximisation project in metro railway network in India or overseas – number of stations	8																						
	10-25 stations: 70% of max points																							
	26-50 stations: 85% of max points																							
	More than 50 stations: 100% of max points																							
58	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 24	<p>Team Leader: We understand that MBA/ PGDM includes master's management in construction / Real Estate/ Finance / Marketing. Kindly confirm our understanding.</p>	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 3.																					
59	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 25	<p>Transit Media & Transit Retail Specialist: As the degree for MBA course is named differently by different Universities but the curriculum remains the same. Hence, we understand that the MBA/ PGDM will also include Master of Management Studies degree. Kindly clarify.</p>	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 4.																					
60	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 25	<p>Urban Designer / Transport Planner / Engineer: We request the Authority to also consider the Post Grad in Planning/ Urban Design/ Transportation planning/ Transportation Engineering.</p>	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 6																					
61	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 24	<p>We request the Authority to kindly modify the Qualifications and technical experience as per the following:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Personnel</th> <th>Qualification</th> <th>Eligibility Assignment</th> <th>Minimum Experience</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Team Leader</td> <td><u>CA</u> /MBA/PGDM/ <u>Master in Transport Planning from an accredited college/ university from Tier 4 institute / university</u></td> <td>Should have completed minimum 3 commercial/ revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in transport sector in India as Team Leader (not including metro rail). Should have completed/</td> <td>15 years</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Personnel	Qualification	Eligibility Assignment	Minimum Experience	Team Leader	<u>CA</u> /MBA/PGDM/ <u>Master in Transport Planning from an accredited college/ university from Tier 4 institute / university</u>	Should have completed minimum 3 commercial/ revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in transport sector in India as Team Leader (not including metro rail). Should have completed/	15 years	Refer Addendum Sr No. 3													
Personnel	Qualification	Eligibility Assignment	Minimum Experience																					
Team Leader	<u>CA</u> /MBA/PGDM/ <u>Master in Transport Planning from an accredited college/ university from Tier 4 institute / university</u>	Should have completed minimum 3 commercial/ revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in transport sector in India as Team Leader (not including metro rail). Should have completed/	15 years																					

SN	Section No.	Query Received				MMRCL Response			
				ongoing minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in metro sector in India as Team Leader.					
62	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 25	We request the Authority to kindly modify the Qualifications and technical experience as per the following:				Refer Addendum Sr No. 4			
<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="405 645 564 696">Personnel</th> <th data-bbox="569 645 745 696">Qualification</th> <th data-bbox="750 645 938 696">Eligibility Assignment</th> <th data-bbox="943 645 1114 696">Minimum Experience</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td data-bbox="405 703 564 1496">Transit Media & Transit Retail Specialist</td> <td data-bbox="569 703 745 1496">MBA/PGDM from <u>an accredited college/</u> institute / university</td> <td data-bbox="750 703 938 1496">Should have completed minimum 3 commercial/ revenue maximisation/ transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in transport sector in India (not including metro rail) Should have completed/ ongoing minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in metro sector in India.</td> <td data-bbox="943 703 1114 1496"><u>10</u> years</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Personnel	Qualification	Eligibility Assignment	Minimum Experience	Transit Media & Transit Retail Specialist		MBA/PGDM from <u>an accredited college/</u> institute / university	Should have completed minimum 3 commercial/ revenue maximisation/ transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in transport sector in India (not including metro rail) Should have completed/ ongoing minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in metro sector in India.	<u>10</u> years
Personnel	Qualification	Eligibility Assignment	Minimum Experience						
Transit Media & Transit Retail Specialist	MBA/PGDM from <u>an accredited college/</u> institute / university	Should have completed minimum 3 commercial/ revenue maximisation/ transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in transport sector in India (not including metro rail) Should have completed/ ongoing minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in metro sector in India.	<u>10</u> years						
63	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 25	We request the Authority to kindly modify the Qualifications and technical experience as per the following:				Refer Addendum Sr No. 5			
<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="405 1563 564 1615">Personnel</th> <th data-bbox="569 1563 745 1615">Qualification</th> <th data-bbox="750 1563 938 1615">Eligibility Assignment</th> <th data-bbox="943 1563 1114 1615">Minimum Experience</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td data-bbox="405 1621 564 2069">Commercial Revenue & Contracts Specialist</td> <td data-bbox="569 1621 745 2069">MBA/PGDM from <u>an accredited college/</u> institute / university</td> <td data-bbox="750 1621 938 2069">Should have completed minimum 3 commercial/ revenue maximisation/ transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in transport sector in India (not including metro rail).</td> <td data-bbox="943 1621 1114 2069"><u>10</u> years</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Personnel	Qualification	Eligibility Assignment	Minimum Experience	Commercial Revenue & Contracts Specialist		MBA/PGDM from <u>an accredited college/</u> institute / university	Should have completed minimum 3 commercial/ revenue maximisation/ transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in transport sector in India (not including metro rail).	<u>10</u> years
Personnel	Qualification	Eligibility Assignment	Minimum Experience						
Commercial Revenue & Contracts Specialist	MBA/PGDM from <u>an accredited college/</u> institute / university	Should have completed minimum 3 commercial/ revenue maximisation/ transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in transport sector in India (not including metro rail).	<u>10</u> years						

SN	Section No.	Query Received				MMRCL Response								
				Should have completed/ ongoing minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in metro sector in India.										
64	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 25	<p>We request the Authority to kindly modify the Qualifications and technical experience as per the following:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Personnel</th> <th>Qualification</th> <th>Eligibility Assignment</th> <th>Minimum Experience</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Urban Designer / Transport Planner / Engineer</td> <td>Post Grad in Urban Design/Transportation Planning/Transportation Engineering/ <u>Housing Planning from an accredited college/ university</u></td> <td>Should have completed minimum 3 urban design / transport design/ urban planning assignments in India. Should have completed/ ongoing minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in metro sector in India.</td> <td>10 years</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>				Personnel	Qualification	Eligibility Assignment	Minimum Experience	Urban Designer / Transport Planner / Engineer	Post Grad in Urban Design/Transportation Planning/Transportation Engineering/ <u>Housing Planning from an accredited college/ university</u>	Should have completed minimum 3 urban design / transport design/ urban planning assignments in India. Should have completed/ ongoing minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in metro sector in India.	10 years	Refer to Addendum Sr No. 6
Personnel	Qualification	Eligibility Assignment	Minimum Experience											
Urban Designer / Transport Planner / Engineer	Post Grad in Urban Design/Transportation Planning/Transportation Engineering/ <u>Housing Planning from an accredited college/ university</u>	Should have completed minimum 3 urban design / transport design/ urban planning assignments in India. Should have completed/ ongoing minimum 1 commercial / revenue maximisation / transaction advisory assignments for non-fare revenue in metro sector in India.	10 years											
65	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 25	<p>Please confirm if the following Support Personnel are to be deployed at MMRCL and for what duration of the project? Deploy Support Professional of about 5 years' experience, having expertise of:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Commercial Expert Jr. 2. Transport Engineer 3. Architect Jr 				Support Personnel are to assist the Key Professionals to deliver the assignment. The period of deployment is as per requirement.								
66	Data Sheet-16 Criteria for Key Professionals - Page 24 & 25	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. We request the Authority to consider Ongoing Projects as well for eligible transport assignments. 2. We request the Authority to kindly consider 40% completed projects as ongoing projects along with CA certificate, receipts against invoices raised or equivalent proof that the assignment has been 40% completed must be submitted. 				1 & 2. Tender conditions prevail								

SN	Section No.	Query Received	MMRCL Response																		
67	Data Sheet - 23.2 Evaluation Under Technical Experience of Firms - Page 26	<p>We request the Authority to kindly modify the clause as:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Sr. No.</th> <th>Criteria</th> <th>Points</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>Experience in Non-fare Revenue estimation / maximization projects in transport sector in India or overseas Projects (excluding metro rail projects)</td> <td>10</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>Experience in NFBR Revenue maximisation project in metro railway network in India and /or overseas – number of projects</td> <td>12</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>Experience in NFBR Revenue maximisation project in metro railway network in India or overseas – number of Stations</td> <td>6</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4</td> <td>Additional marks for metro rail NFBR Revenue maximization project in Mumbai Metropolitan Region</td> <td>2</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">TOTAL points for Criterion (1)</td> <td>30</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Similar study has been done only for two metro lines in Mumbai. Considering the same, the above scoring criteria of providing 2 additional marks for having done metro commercial projects in Mumbai is highly restrictive. In a 80:20 selection format, scoring advantage of 2 marks will be unjustified and stifle competition. All of this will ultimately not be in the best interest of MMRC. We therefore request MMRCL to delete this condition.</p>	Sr. No.	Criteria	Points	1	Experience in Non-fare Revenue estimation / maximization projects in transport sector in India or overseas Projects (excluding metro rail projects)	10	2	Experience in NFBR Revenue maximisation project in metro railway network in India and /or overseas – number of projects	12	3	Experience in NFBR Revenue maximisation project in metro railway network in India or overseas – number of Stations	6	4	Additional marks for metro rail NFBR Revenue maximization project in Mumbai Metropolitan Region	2	TOTAL points for Criterion (1)		30	Tender conditions prevail
Sr. No.	Criteria	Points																			
1	Experience in Non-fare Revenue estimation / maximization projects in transport sector in India or overseas Projects (excluding metro rail projects)	10																			
2	Experience in NFBR Revenue maximisation project in metro railway network in India and /or overseas – number of projects	12																			
3	Experience in NFBR Revenue maximisation project in metro railway network in India or overseas – number of Stations	6																			
4	Additional marks for metro rail NFBR Revenue maximization project in Mumbai Metropolitan Region	2																			
TOTAL points for Criterion (1)		30																			
68	Data Sheet - 23.2 Evaluation Under Technical Experience of Firms - Pg 27	Request Authority to amend the following clause: Marking for Criteria 1	Tender conditions prevail																		
69	Data Sheet - 23.2 Evaluation Under Technical Experience of Firms - Pg 27	Request Authority to amend the following clause: Marking for Criteria 2	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 8																		
70	Data Sheet - 23.2 Evaluation Under Technical Experience of Firms - Pg 27	Request Authority to amend the following clause: Marking for Criteria 3	Refer Addendum Sr. No. 9																		
71	Data Sheet - 23.2 Evaluation Under Technical Experience of Firms - Pg 27	Request Authority to amend the following clause: Marking for Criteria 4	Tender conditions prevail																		
72	Data Sheet 3. Criteria for Technical Experience of firms (Note. iii) ITC Cl. 6a - Page 23	<p>We request the Authority to kindly modify the following clause as per below: Note: Evaluation under ITC Clause 6 would be done based on the number and quality of the assignments completed undertaken within the last 10 15 years of the Bid submission deadline.</p>	Tender conditions prevail																		
73	Terms of Reference Deliverables & Payment Schedule Section 3 - Page 31	<p>We suggest the Authority that the feasibility report should be prepared for the entire alignment – both phases and shall evaluate the potential of all revenue maximization options. Hence, we request the Authority to kindly modify the clause as follows:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Payment Milestone</th> <th>% of total fees</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Inception Report</td> <td>10% (T+0.5m)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Feasibility and bid structuring report</td> <td>13% (T +4 m)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Payment Milestone	% of total fees	Inception Report	10% (T+0.5m)	Feasibility and bid structuring report	13% (T +4 m)	Tender conditions prevail. It is envisaged that the reports and tenders shall be prepared for the entire alignment.												
Payment Milestone	% of total fees																				
Inception Report	10% (T+0.5m)																				
Feasibility and bid structuring report	13% (T +4 m)																				

SN	Section No.	Query Received	MMRCL Response
74	Terms of Reference Deliverables & Payment Schedule Section 3 - Page 31	<p>1) As the NFBR transactions shall be executed over different time period, please clarify, when shall the Success Fee be payable to the Consultant?</p> <p>2) We request the Authority to kindly modify the clause as per the following: A one-time Success Fee amounting to 1.5% of the 1st two years equivalent license fee (for the two-year lock-in period which is confirmed) received through all NFBR sources shall be payable provided that total two-year equivalent license fees exceed ₹ 75 Cr. (exclusive of taxes) for all NFBR sources and shall be applied only on the amount in excess of ₹ 75 Cr. (exclusive of taxes).</p>	<p>1. The success fee shall be paid at the end of the assignment.</p> <p>2. Tender conditions prevail.</p>
75	Terms of Reference Section 3 - Page 30	As mentioned in the RFP, the DPRs for Direct access are under preparation, hence request the Authority to clarify if the Consultant is required to undertake feasibility for Direct access.	Consultant shall explore new Direct Access connections for which they should conduct required feasibility.



Executive Director (Planning)
Mumbai Metro Rail Corporation Limited

DISCLAIMER:

All information provided as a part of this document to the prospective applicants by the Mumbai Metro Rail Corporation Limited is subject to the terms and conditions set out by Mumbai Metro Rail Corporation Limited and as shall be laid down in the agreement of contract to be executed between Mumbai Metro Rail Corporation Limited and the Applicant.

The objective of this document is to provide information to the interested parties about requirement of Mumbai Metro Rail Corporation Limited to facilitate their application for the project. This document does not claim to contain all the information as may be required at the time of execution of work. Each applicant is advised to conduct its own survey for commissioning the work and check the accuracy, reliability and completeness of the information in this RFP document and obtain independent advice from appropriate sources as deemed necessary. Mumbai Metro Rail Corporation Limited makes no representation or warranty and shall incur no liability under any law, statute, rules or regulations as to the accuracy, reliability or completeness of this document. Mumbai Metro Rail Corporation Limited may, at their absolute discretion, but without being under any obligation to do so, update, amend or supplement the information in this document.

----- END OF DOCUMENT -----