

Minutes of the Meeting for Public Consultation held for the various PAPs affected due to the construction of Girgaon Metro Station on Metro Line III - held at The Goan Institute on 29.03.2019 from 10:30 am onwards

Mumbai Metro Rail Corporation (MMRC) held a public consultation meeting at The Goan Institute, Kalbadevi for the PAPs affected due to the construction of Girgaon Metro Station. Meeting was conducted in 3 Sessions on 29th March 2019 from 10:30 am to 4:30 pm.

1. Following dignitaries were present for the meeting:
 - a. Shri. R. Ramana, Executive Director (Planning), MMRC
 - b. Smt. Maya Patole, General Manager (R&R), MMRC
 - c. Shri. Dayanand Chincholikar, Senior Deputy General Manager (Land Acquisition), MMRC
 - d. Smt. Sangita Warade, Tehsildar/ Deputy General Manager (R&R), MMRC
 - e. Shri. Anil Kambale, Deputy General Manager (Civil), MMRC
 - f. Shri. Swetal Kanwalu, Assistant General Manager (Town Planner), MMRC
 - g. Smt. Krutika Patil, Assistant General Manager (Civil), MMRC
 - h. Shri. Dikshant Meshram, Deputy Town Planner, MMRC
 - i. Smt. Farha Irani, Deputy Town Planner, MMRC
 - j. Shri. Manoj Kanbar, M/s. Catapult Consultant
 - k. Shri. Abhijeet Ingle, M/s. Catapult Consultant
 - l. Shri. Vilas Bhosale & Others, M/s. Catapult Consultant
2. **Session 1:** was conducted for the PAPs from Chandra Mahal, New Chandra Mahal and Thakurdwar Shed at 10:45 am.

Session 2: was conducted for the PAPs from Surya Mahal, Surya Mahal Block, Tara Mahal and Kranti Nagar at 12:15 pm.

Session 3: was conducted for the PAPs from Vitthaldas, VIP Luggage, Swami Niwas, Shree Ram Bhawan and Annapurna Niwas at 03:30 pm.
3. GM (R&R) introduced the MMRC team & M/s. Catapult Consultant representatives and appreciated all PAPs present for their cooperation. She briefed about the 6 Blocks, i.e. K1, K2, K3, G1, G2 & G3. Out of these, K2 Block is entirely commercial use, K3 Block accommodates both residential use & shops, and G3 Block comprises of all uses.
4. Executive Director (Planning) explained that almost all plots are acquired and are in MMRC's ownership. And the remaining plots will be acquired in 2-3 months.

5. AGM (Town Planner) presented slides on the proposed K2, K3 and G3 plans. The construction of these Blocks would be carried out in Phase 1 & 2 depending on the completion of metro works on site. Planning with respect to site constraints was also explained to the PAPs.

6. Post the presentation, Executive Director (Planning) mentioned that MMRC has strived to rehabilitate the PAPs as early as possible. Metro construction would take additional 2 years for completion and hence, MMRC is working in the available space to fit units for rehabilitation of PAPs.

7. The above-mentioned process was followed for Sessions 2 & 3. During Session 2, at the very beginning, PAPs insisted to rehab them in G3 only. After insistence from GM (R&R), the PAPs agreed to view the presentation related to G3 Block only. Further the PAPs of Kranti Nagar threatened of agitation if their demand for rehabilitation within G3 Block is not accepted.

8. Following were the specific queries put forth by PAPs and their replies from MMRC:

Sr. No.	Specific Queries/ Remarks by PAPs	Reply From MMRC
1	Rehab units of Girgaon to be accommodated in G3 Block itself. If required, the PAPs have agreed to wait for the completion of metro works, for getting accommodated in Phase 2 of G3 Block.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All the acquired plots are within 1 km. Rehabilitation is done within the closest plot considering the planning constraints and metro works. While planning, priority is given to accommodate the residential PAPs at the earliest. 2. Their concerns are noted and MMRC will further work on the same. MMRC also mentioned that further time of 3-4 months will be required for reworking the scheme. 3. MMRC will take in writing from PAPs that the delay is acceptable and there will be no opposition to the metro in operation. There will be a lottery conducted for units to be allotted in Phase 1 & 2. Those allotted units in Phase 2 will have to wait for the completion of metro works and the consequent construction of Phase 2 of G3 Block.
2	Why are saleable units shown in G3 Block? It seems that sale component is getting priority and not residents.	During planning of the scheme, the priority is given to rehabilitation of the PAPs. G3 Block is divided in Phase 1 & 2, wherein the construction of phase 2 will be undertaken post completion of metro works.

Sr. No.	Specific Queries/ Remarks by PAPs	Reply From MMRC
3	Wasn't MMRC aware of the planning and plots constraints earlier?	The new DCPR 2034 of MCGM, which has come into force on 8 th May 2018, has increased the road setbacks, marginal open spaces leading to reduction in the building footprint.
4	What if the PAPs can't pay for the additional areas arising from odd sized rooms?	Plans are according to agreement and MMRC will try to accommodate all.
5	For those PAPs who are allotted flats in Phase 2, will rent be provided till the rehab units are not provided?	Yes.
6	Post handing over of units, maintenance of the rehab to be payed by MMRC for the next 10 years.	This point to be examined later as the meeting is for discussion of plans only.
7	G3 Block has sale component of Commercial units also.	Only rehab units of commercial PAPs are accommodated in G3 Block.
8	PAPs who have not vacated their premises, will not leave till the plans are not changed to accommodate all in G3 Block. Also, they will hold protests and not allow construction of metro works on site.	MMRC requested the PAPs to vacate their premises as metro work is of highest priority. Further, it will cause delay in execution of rehabilitation and redevelopment scheme.
9	All rehab units including residential and commercial units to be rehabilitated in the original location of road facing and ground floor, if applicable.	In any given redevelopment project, ground floor is planned for stilt, parking, amenities, etc. Retail spaces are created in G3 and K3 Blocks. Design considerations limit such demands, but the concerns are noted.
10	PAPs raised issue regarding delay in receiving the rent cheques.	All the cheques of concerned PAPs will be given in April 2019.
11	Public Consultation meetings are to be held on a holiday and with all PAPs.	Concern is noted.
12	Will developer be appointed for construction of the Blocks?	As a government organization, tendering for the works will be done and a contractor will be appointed for the same.
13	What if decision is not taken for the PAPs' MHADA Appeal at the time of signing of the permanent agreement?	There is provision for 3 Appeals with MHADA and the status of the Appeal at the time of signing of the permanent agreement will be considered final (different stages of Appeal were presented). The rehabilitation of ineligible PAPs is the responsibility of MMRC.
14	In what ways is MMRC supporting PAPs for MHADA Appeal?	Out of the 124 Appeals filed so far, MHADA has disposed 50 such cases and

Sr. No.	Specific Queries/ Remarks by PAPs	Reply From MMRC
		MMRC is following up for the balance 74 cases. At the time of the Appeal, a representative from M/s. Catapult Consultant is present.
15	MHADA area calculation mentioned common areas to be added in carpet area.	Total carpet Area will be considered as approved by MHADA.
16	Where will K3 and G3 plans be available for review?	Plans shall be revisited as per PAPs suggestions/demands and then made available in 3-4 months.
17	Can the commercial units be converted into residential units at this stage?	Procedure for the same has been conducted and 53 such requests have been considered. If any further requests, then the same to be written to MMRC and the same will be subject to design considerations/availability.
18	If certain PAPs are willing to pay for additional area than their eligibility, is it possible to register for the same? How to register request for additional area required by any PAP?	Procedure for the same was conducted earlier and the demands have ranged from 100 to 600 sq.ft. additional area. Such requests can be registered even now at MMRC Office. Rates for the same are to be decided later.

Post each session discussion, Executive Director (Planning) thanked all the PAPs for attending the public consultation.

Minutes of the Meeting for Public Consultation held for the various PAPs affected due to the construction of Girgaon Metro Station on Metro Line III - held at The Goan Institute on 03.04.2019 from 11:00 am onwards

Mumbai Metro Rail Corporation (MMRC) held a public consultation meeting at The Goan Institute, Kalbadevi for the PAPs affected due to the construction of Girgaon Metro Station. Meeting was conducted in 3 Sessions on 03rd April 2019 from 10:30 am to 4:00 pm.

1. Following dignitaries were present for the meeting:
 - a. Shri. R. Ramana, Executive Director (Planning), MMRC
 - b. Smt. Maya Patole, General Manager (R&R), MMRC
 - c. Shri. Dayanand Chincholikar, Senior Deputy General Manager (Land Acquisition), MMRC
 - d. Smt. Sangita Warade, Tehsildar/ Deputy General Manager (R&R), MMRC
 - e. Shri. Anil Kambale, Deputy General Manager (Civil), MMRC
 - f. Shri. Swetal Kanwalu, Assistant General Manager (Town Planner), MMRC
 - g. Smt. Krutika Patil, Assistant General Manager (Civil), MMRC
 - h. Shri. Dikshant Meshram, Deputy Town Planner, MMRC
 - i. Smt. Farha Irani, Deputy Town Planner, MMRC
 - j. Shri. Manoj Kanbar, M/s. Catapult Consultant
 - k. Shri. Abhijeet Ingle, M/s. Catapult Consultant
 - l. Shri. Vilas Bhosale & Others, M/s. Catapult Consultant
2. **Session 1:** was conducted for the PAPs from Pokhraj, Kamaniwadi, Chuggumal, Building No. 591, Chatriwala/ Katawala, Khan House, Dharamsee at 11:00 am.
Session 2: was conducted for the PAPs from Jain Bhawan, Flower Mansion, Amrut Niwas, Alim Bhawan at 12:15pm
Session 3: was conducted for the PAPs from Fish Market (Tallying) at 03:00 pm.
3. GM (R&R) introduced the MMRC team & M/s. Catapult Consultant representatives and appreciated all PAPs present for their cooperation. She briefed about the 6 Blocks, i.e. K1, K2, K3, G1, G2 & G3. Out of these, K2 Block is entirely commercial use, K3 Block accommodates both residential use & shops, and G3 Block comprises of all uses.
4. Executive Director (Planning) explained that almost all plots are acquired and are in MMRC's ownership. And the remaining plots will be acquired in 2-3 months.
5. AGM (Town Planner) presented slides on the proposed K2, K3 and G3 plans. The construction of these Blocks would be carried out in Phase 1 & 2 depending on the completion of metro works on site. Planning with respect to site constraints was also explained to the PAPs.
6. Post the presentation, Executive Director (Planning) mentioned that MMRC has strived to rehabilitate the PAPs as early as possible. Metro construction would take additional 2 years for

completion and hence, MMRC is working in the available space to fit units for rehabilitation of PAPs.

7. The above-mentioned process was followed for Sessions 2 & 3.

8. Following were the specific queries put forth by PAPs and their replies from MMRC:

Sr. No.	Specific Queries/ Remarks by PAPs	Reply From MMRC
1	PAPs questioned where the shops of K3 block be shifted?	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. MMRC responded that efforts have been taken to shift K3 shops in K3 block itself, however allotment for the same is awaited. 2. Due to the new DCPR, road setback, marginal open spaces has increased. 3. There is a proposed road widening for Dadi Santook Lane too. 4. The metro entry-exit is proposed facing J.S.S. Road at K3 block.
2	Where are the existing K2 shops planned to be shifted permanently?	K2 shops in relation to Fish market would be rehabilitated at k2 block whereas all the other shops would be shifted to G3 Block.
3	PAPs raised a query that existing ground floor shops, if not permanently rehabilitated on ground floor would lose its visibility. How would MMRC compensate for the same to the shop owners?	MMRC stated that efforts have been taken to rehabilitate ground floor shops at ground floor itself. However, even the shops proposed to be rehabilitated on upper floors would not lose the visibility as a commercial complex type of setup is worked out for the commercial PAPs, thus appreciating the value.
4	PAPs of K1 raised query on why no development is happening at K1 block?	MMRC explained that there has been a change in the alignment and reduction in size of station box at K1. This has led to the entire K1 block being used for Metro activities.
5	PAPs requested to rehabilitate the residents of K1 block at the same location and not at K3 as the same do not get the road frontage as against their existing tenements.	Same as above.
6	PAPs of Kamaniwadi asked when will they be able to get the drawings and where will Bhojanalaya and Banquet hall be shifted?	MMRC, through this meeting is taking suggestions and objections from the PAPs. Based on the suggestions, MMRC would revise the plans. Post approval from Competent Authorities, plans would be made available to the PAPs.

Sr. No.	Specific Queries/ Remarks by PAPs	Reply From MMRC
7	Is the rent received by the PAPs as compensation taxable?	MMRCL replied that it is in talks with the Income Tax Department for the same.
8	When is MMRC going to start construction on K3 and G3?	MMRC replied that construction on K3 and G3 would be in two phases. Phase 1 will start post inviting tenders and selection of the contractor. This will help in part accommodation at phase 1 by 2021. Phase 2 will start post metro works.
9	All rehab commercial or shops that enjoyed road frontage should location of road facing, and ground floor was the request raised by the PAPs.	In any given redevelopment project, ground floor is planned for stilt, parking, amenities, etc. Retail spaces are created in G3 and K3 Blocks. Design considerations limit such demands, but the concerns are noted.
10	PAPs raised issue regarding delay in receiving the rent cheques for renewals and PAPs who have signed agreements recently.	All the cheques of concerned PAPs will be given in April 2019.
11	What will happen if the project gets delayed?	Rent to the PAPs will be paid until re-shifting to the permanent accommodation. MMRC also mentioned that currently only approx. 30 PAPs are left to vacate their premises.
12	PAPs asked regarding provision of parking on K2, K3 and G3.	Originally PAPs, in their existing tenements did not have parking. Parking allotment is not yet done by MMRC but there is a thought to have parking for common usage. For parking, parking tower is proposed at k3 block and basement parking at G3 block. MMRCL also stressed that MCGM does not allow basement parking for more than 2-3 floors, thus restricting the accommodation of parking requirements. As the buildings are proposed to be integrated with the Metro, PAPs in future are going to have a robust public transportation system at disposal.
13	What if decision is not taken for the PAPs' MHADA Appeal at the time of signing of the permanent agreement?	There is provision for 3 Appeals with MHADA and the status of the Appeal at the time of signing of the permanent agreement will be considered final (different stages of Appeal were presented). The rehabilitation of ineligible PAPs is the responsibility of MMRC.
14	In what ways is MMRC supporting PAPs for MHADA Appeal?	Out of the 124 Appeals filed so far, MHADA has disposed 50 such cases and MMRC is

Sr. No.	Specific Queries/ Remarks by PAPs	Reply From MMRC
		following up for the balance 74 cases. At the time of the Appeal, a representative from M/s. Catapult Consultant is present.
15	What are the finalized rates for seeking extra area?	The rates are under finalization by MMRCL. PAPs can still request for extra area, however the rates for the same would be communicated post finalization.
16	Where will K3 and G3 plans be available for review?	Plans shall be revisited as per PAPs suggestions/demands and then made available in 3-4 months.
17	Can the commercial units be converted into residential units at this stage?	Procedure for the same has been conducted and 53 such requests have been considered. If any further requests, then the same to be written to MMRC and the same will be subject to design considerations/availability.
18	If certain PAPs are willing to pay for additional area than their eligibility, is it possible to register for the same? How to register request for additional area required by any PAP?	Procedure for the same was conducted earlier and the demands have ranged from 100 to 600sq.ft. additional area. Such requests can be registered even now at MMRC Office. Rates for the same are to be decided later.
19	PAPs asked what design measures are taken to avoid fish vendors occupying road and outside the building for selling fish?	MMRC confirmed that fish market is designed as per the regulations and all facilities and required spaces are incorporated in the design for its efficient use.
20	What is the total tentative timeline for the project completion?	Phase 1 is proposed to be completed by December 2021 and Phase 2 will be completed 2 years post commissioning of metro. Rent to the PAPs will be paid until shifted to permanent accommodations.
21	MMRCL should provide for Corpus fund and for the formation of the society as the maintenance of these high-rise developments would put a heavy burden on the current PAPs, who currently do not have to bear the burden of the maintenance.	MMRC replied that it will go as per the regulations stated by MHADA for corpus fund. In addition, MMRC would help in the formation of the society by the PAPs.
22	When will MMRCL sign the permanent alternate accommodation agreements with the PAPs?	MMRC will execute the agreements with the PAPs post the approval of plans from MCGM.
23	Will the commercial units be self-contained?	MMRC has proposed common toilets for the commercial units and shops. However,

Sr. No.	Specific Queries/ Remarks by PAPs	Reply From MMRC
		specialized commercial activities, such as dispensaries etc. would be self-contained.
24	Will there be saleable area in K3?	The plans are under revision as per the suggestions received by the PAPs and hence the query cannot be replied now.
25	Most of the agreements are executed mostly for 2-3 years. What about the brokerage for the agreements post 2-3 years?	One-time brokerage as agency charges has already been paid to the PAPs. Additional brokerage cannot be paid by MMRCL.
26	We do not want the same circulation for the Fish Market and the commercials above at K2 block.	MMRCL proposed that there will be a segregation in the circulation for the fish market below and the commercial above at K2 block.
27	We have ground floor shops and have availed MCGM shop and establishment licence. Now that we have shifted to other locations, BMC has revoked the licence seeking the change in location.	MMRC confirmed that this issue would be addressed with MCGM.
28	We have scrap metal shop in Fish Market which are road facing. The proposed shops are also requested to be having the road frontage as the business cannot sustain is the shops do not have road frontage.	MMRC has noted the request.
29	Where will the masala shops/ other shops in fish market be shifted post allocation to permanent accommodation as these shops cannot sustain if not in proximity to the fish market?	The masala or shops related to fish market are proposed to be permanently shifted adjacent to fish market itself in K2 block.

Post each session discussion, Executive Director (Planning) thanked all the PAPs for attending the public consultation.
